

PENNSYLVANIA ORNITHOLOGICAL RECORDS COMMITTEE

2469 Hammertown Road

Narvon, PA 17555

September 26, 1997

David Kyler  
RD 4 Box 159A  
Huntingdon, PA 16652

Dear David,

Thank you for submitting documentation on the Hoary Redpoll you saw in Mattawana, Mifflin County on 17 March 1994 to P.O.R.C. After careful review, we regret that we are unable to accept this record. The committee was concerned that because of the high degree of variability in redpoll plumages, the documentation submitted lacked adequate detail regarding the description of the undertail coverts and the color of the breast important field marks in separating Hoary and Common Redpoll (Czaplak 1995). Because of the overlap in some plumage characteristics between the two redpoll species, the committee prefers to err on the side of caution regarding this report.

This of course, does not mean the bird was not a Hoary Redpoll, merely, that the record is not beyond reasonable doubt for acceptance

We hope that this does not discourage you from submitting documentation on any rare birds you find in the future. Please be encouraged to send as much detail as possible when submitting a report.

Sincerely,

Nick Pulcinella  
Chairman

Record # 887-05-1994

Reference: Czaplak, D. 1995. Identifying Common and Hoary Redpolls in Winter.  
*Birding* 27:447-457

887-05-1994

**Hoary Redpoll**  
**17 March 1994**

On a return birding trip from eastern Pennsylvania my "birding buddies" Melvin Lane, Margaret Kenepp and I stopped in Mattawana, Pa. [Mifflin County] to visit with an old friend of ours, Annie Yoder. While enjoying tea and cookies with Annie in the late afternoon she proceeded to inform us that she thought she had a Hoary Redpoll or two mixed in with her resident flock of 175-200 Common Redpoll.

While we surveyed the "cloud" of feeding Redpoll species I did identify what I believed to be a single Hoary Redpoll (*Carduelis hornemanni*) among the many Common Redpoll (*Carduelis flammea*) that were visiting Annie's many niger feeders. The feeders were located in a small apple tree located approximately ten feet from Annie's enclosed, heated back porch.

The lone Hoary Redpoll showed a lighter overall appearance than any of the Common Redpoll, either male or female, and had a pronounced white rump patch that showed no sign of any longitudinal streaking. The light wash was even more apparent when observed through 8.5x 44 binoculars at close range. In fact after a short time it was possible to pick out this individual, while feeding on the ground, without the aide of binoculars.

The bill appeared to be smaller in size and more conical in shape when compared to the surrounding Common Redpoll. I had the impression that the base of the bill was indented and highlighted by wispy fine feathers. Others in the group thought that they had identified a second individual, in the flock, but all that I could identify was one.

Birding "hotlines" were notified locally and several interested birders visited Annie's home but unfortunately most of the combined Redpoll flock left early on 18 March 1994 and the Hoary Redpoll probably left with them. No photographic evidence to verify this sighting is available.

Optics used were 8.5x44 Swift Audubon binoculars, on close focus, under late afternoon sunny skies. Winds were light and the cookies were homemade !!

David Kyler



R.D.#4 Box 159A

Huntingdon, Pa. 16652

(814) 643-6030

Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee

Voting Tabulation - Round # 1 of

Species: Hoary Redpoll (*Carduelis hornemanni*)

Date of Sighting: 17 March 1994 to 17 March 1994

Location: MATTAWANA

County: MIFFLIN

Observer(s): Dave Kyler

Date of Submission: 1996

Submitted by: Dave Kyler

Written Description: YES Photo: NO Specimen: NO

Recording: NONE

Member	Class I	Class II	Class III	Class IV	Class V			Abstain
					A	B	C	
F. Haas				X				
N. Pulcinella				X				
E. Kwater				X				
R. Ickes			X					
G. McWilliams				X				
P. Schwalbe						X		
S. Feldstein				X				
TOTALS			1	5		1		
DECISION				X				

Comments:

Signature (Secretary):

*J. C. Haas*

Date:

2-22-97